When the Second Dimension Comes First:
Race, “Populism,” and Social Provisions in the U.S. and France

QUINN MULROY
THOMAS OGORZALEK
NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY
TORONTO POL DEVELOPMENT WORKSHOP
Similar electoral dynamics

- Brexit 2016
- USA 2016
- France 2017
Similar electoral dynamics

- Brexit 2016
- **USA 2016**
- France 2017
Similar electoral dynamics

- Brexit 2016
- USA 2016
- France 2017
Unexpected electoral results in some of the world’s most stable democracies...

An urgent concern about democracy embedded in this discussion (Lee 2019)

Turning to the concept of “populism” to explain: a “thin-centered” ideology (Freeden 1998)
European parties: economic and cultural values

Bloc clustered on “Right” end of the cultural 2nd-dimension are positioned:

1) Off of the traditional “bottom-L, top-R” diagonal

2) Across the economic 1st-dimension

(Inglehart and Norris 2016)
BRING BACK THE DEATH PENALTY.
BRING BACK OUR POLICE!

What has happened to our City over the past ten years? What has happened to law and order in the neighborhoods? All uncooperative people including our homes and facilities, the cop who had the power under the law to help us in times of danger, keep us safe from those who would prey on innocent lives to fulfill some twisted inner need. What has happened to the joy of a neighborhood, the celebration by the store, society and the police for those who broke the law, who normally praise on the rights of others? What has happened to the common breaking of life as we know it?

Many New York families — White, Black, Hispanic and Asian — have had to give up legal protection and instead have been forced to live in the streets. The only way they know is to live a life of death threatening violence, one where the police roam as best they can, and the community is forced to live in fear.

This is unacceptable. The continued breakdown of the city by criminal behavior is criminal and must be ended. Criminals must be held accountable. They must face the consequences of their actions. They must be forced to understand that they will be held accountable.

Donald J. Trump

LES IMMIGRÉS VONT VOTER...

ET VOUS VOUS ABSTENEZ ?!

FRONT NATIONAL

[Image of a political advertisement for Front National]
Culture-first forces prioritize, and are highly ideological on, 2nd-dimension issues.
Motivating Questions

How do second-dimension concerns shape economic preferences?

Where do culture-first forces stand on economic issues?

What happens, in other words, when the second dimension comes first?
Diversity presents “governance challenges”

Difficult Coordination
Divergent Preferences
Group Threat
What is the political economy of far-right racial politics?

Racial fractionalization is associated with decreased social spending

(Alesina, Glaeser and Sacerdote 2001)
Diminished State Model

Diversity Increase  ?  Diminished Social Provision
Diminished State Model

- Diversity Increase
- Group threat
- Culture-First Forces
- Group rivalry politics
- Diminished Social Provision
Context, Timing, and Sequencing

Must consider the social provision context in which the diminished state model plays out: shapes the (secondary) economic appeals made by culture-first forces.
Diminished State Model

- **Diversity Increase**
  - $t = 0$

- **Culture-First Forces**
  - $t = 1$

- **Diminished Social Provision**
  - $t = 2$

- **Existing Social Provision Policy**
  - $t = -1$

- Group threat
- Group rivalry politics

Path dependency
Diminished State Model: USA

Diversity Increase
\[ t = 0 \]

Group threat

Culture-First Forces
\[ t = 1 \]

Group rivalry politics

Diminished Social Provision
\[ t = 2 \]
Diminished State Model: France

- **Diversity Increase**
  - $t = 0$

- **Culture-First Forces**
  - $t = 1$

- **Group rivalry politics**

- **Diminished Social Provision**
  - $t = 2$

- **Existing Social Provision Policy**
  - $t = -1$

- Path dependency

- Group threat
The American South

**1933**

**New Deal: statist experimentations**
Democratic party achieves majority status; South’s economy needs help; Dems pursue more “statist” interventions in economy.

**late-1930s**

**South demands regional exemptions from statist intervention**
Forms conservative veto coalition with Republicans (esp. on labor). Nonsouthern Dems include facially race-neutral, but deeply-discriminatory, measures in “Leftist” economic policy.

**1940s**

**South moves to the economic Right**
Opposes “unrelated” 1st-dimension policy that threatens regional racial order; block or hamstring significant policy priorities of the economic Left.
Mean DW-1st dimension scores by bloc, U.S.

The South moves Right on economic issues (while other two blocs get less conservative)
Distribution of DW-1st dimension scores by bloc, U.S.

On economic issues, South moves from Left (1933), to Right (1947)

After 1960s (i.e. when southern economic exemptions are threatened), white South and Republican party coalesce on economic issues
QUIT WORRYING

about which public school your child may be compelled to attend next year. Let us explain how you can get a first class private education at a modest cost.

STONEWALL JACKSON ACADEMY

CALL 393-1922 OR 669-4631 OR WRITE BOX 1245, FLORENCE.
The American South

New Deal: statist experimentations
Democratic party achieves majority status; South’s economy needs help; Dems pursue more “statist” interventions in economy.

late-1930s
South demands regional exemptions from statist intervention
Forms conservative veto coalition with Republicans (esp. on labor). Nonsouthern Dems include facially race-neutral, but deeply-discriminatory, measures in “Leftist” economic policy.

1940s

South moves to the economic Right
Opposes “unrelated” 1st-dimension policy that threatens regional racial order; block or hamstring significant policy priorities of the economic Left

1960s-90s
South brings its cultural conservative priorities to Republican party
South leaves the Democratic party over cultural issues; 1st- and 2nd-dimensions collapse
Front National in France

Building the welfare state

Centralized, modern welfare state established and strengthened during trente glorieuses. Populationniste agenda encourages immigration.

1970s-80s

Diversity and the origin of the FN

Immigration increases from outside Europe. FN born in 1970s as a minor protest party endorsing immigration restrictions. By 1980s, center-right parties co-opt FN cultural messages

1990s

2000s
LES FRANÇAIS D'ABORD

"1 000 000 DE CHOMEURS C'EST 1 000 000 D'IMMIGRES EN TROP"

FRONT NATIONAL
N.B.

LE 12 MARS 1978

VOTEZ POUR

[Image of a man in an official uniform with medals]
FN support in Assemblee Nationale races, France

Electoral support for FN grows over time

Note the changed scale of electoral support between the 1981 and 1986 maps.
JACQUES CHIRAC
82,1%

JEAN-MARIE LE PEN
17,9%
FN support in Assemblee Nationale races, France

Electoral support for FN grows over time
1st and 2nd dimension scores of major party platforms, France

FN party most conservative party on cultural platform, but less conservative on economic issues over time.

FN is now more to Left on economic issues than the current majority party in (En Marche)
FNJ
NI DROITE
NI GAUCHE
FRANÇAIS!

REJOINS-NOUS AU FRONT NATIONAL DE LA JEUNESSE

FNJ : 4 rue Vauguyon 92210 Saint-Cloud - Tel : 01 41 12 10 12
INFO LE PEN JEUNE : 01 41 12 10 10
Front National in France

Building the welfare state
Centralized, modern welfare state established and strengthened during *trente glorieuses*. *Populationniste* agenda encourages immigration.

1970s-80s
Diversity and the origin of the FN
Immigration increases from outside Europe. FN born in 1970s as a minor protest party endorsing immigration restrictions. By 1980s, center-right parties co-opt FN cultural messages

1990s
FN tacks Left on economic issues
Denigrates 1st-dimension politics as outdated. Shifts to more popular left-center stance on economic issues.

2000s
FN electoral success
Clarity and salience of party platforms, France

FN party very clear on cultural platform, but less clear on economic issues
Discussion

Culture-first forces: flexibility on economic platforms

Not *thin* ideologies, just unexpected

New ideologies in “old” political systems
Thank You!

Quinn Mulroy
qmulroy@northwestern.edu

Thomas Ogorzalek
tko@northwestern.edu
Appendix
Dimensions of Political Conflict:
(Inglehart and Norris 2016)
European parties: economic and cultural values

Bloc clustered on “Right” end of the cultural 2nd-dimension are positioned:

1) Off of the traditional “bottom-L, top-R” diagonal
2) Across the economic 1st-dimension

(Inglehart and Norris 2016)
Coalitional Voting

Roll call types using likeness scores between blocs
Temporal Transformation

Southern Democrats increasingly engage in coalitional voting with Republicans.
Temporal Transformation: House

Southern Democrats increasingly engage in coalitional voting with Republicans
Temporal Transformation: Senate

Southern Democrats increasingly engage in coalitional voting with Republicans
Populists

MN Labor

FN

Culture-First Forces

USA white South
Prince Edward County, Virginia. Students demand re-opening of their schools.
Jacques Chirac and Jean-Marie Le Pen got through the first round in 2002.
FNJ
NI DROITE
NI GAUCHE
FRANÇAIS!
REJOINS-NOUS AU FRONT NATIONAL DE LA JEUNESSE

LES FRANÇAIS D’ABORD
"1 000 000 DE CHOMEURS C'EST 1 000 000 D'IMMIGRES EN TROP"
FRONT NATIONAL
LE 12 MARS 1978
VOTEZ

SURFING THE POPULIST WAVE.
LES FRANÇAIS D'ABORD

1 000 000 DE CHOMEURS C'EST 1 000 000 D'IMMIGRES EN TROP

FRONT NATIONAL

LE 12 MARS 1978

VOTEZ POUR
Jacques Chirac: 82,1%
Jean-Marie Le Pen: 17,9%
FN support in Assemblee Nationale races, France
Electoral support for FN grows over time
NI DROITE NI GAUCHE
FRANÇAIS!

REJOINS-NOUS AU FRONT NATIONAL DE LA JEUNESSE

FNJ : 4 rue Vauguyon 92210 Saint-Germain - Tél : 01 41 12 10 12
INFO LE PEN JEUNE : 01 41 12 10 10